How to Critique a Research Paper

Contributors
Sonia A. Duffy, PhD, RN
Lisa Kane Low, PhD, CNM, FACNM
Huey-Ming Tzeng, PhD, RN
Critique Process for Quantitative Studies

- Step I  Comprehension
- Step II  Comparison
- Step III  Analysis
- Step IV  Evaluation
- Step V  Conceptual clustering
Research Critique Guidelines

1. Read the entire research report
2. Examine the organization and presentation of the entire research report
3. Identify the strengths and weaknesses of the study
   - Be objective and realistic
4. Suggest modifications for future studies
Skills Needed to Critique Qualitative Studies

- Context flexibility
- Inductive reasoning
- Conceptualization, theoretical modeling, and theory analysis
- Transforming ideas across levels of abstraction
Standards for Critique of Qualitative Studies

- **Standard I** Descriptive vividness
- **Standard II** Methodological congruence
  - Documentation rigor
  - Procedural rigor
  - Ethical rigor
  - Auditability

- **Standard III** Analytical preciseness

- **Standard IV** Theoretical

- **Standard V** Heuristic relevance
  - Intuitive recognition
  - Relationship to existing body of knowledge
  - Applicability